

Woolwich & Wellesley Townships Elementary Schools Pupil Accommodation Review Minutes of Accommodation Review Committee Meeting #15 October 3, 2012, 6:30 – 8:00 PM St. Jacobs Public School Library

The fifteenth meeting of the Woolwich & Wellesley Townships Elementary Schools Pupil Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) was held at St. Jacobs Public School on Wednesday, October 3, 2012.

Committee Members Present:

Paul Milne, Principal St. Jacobs P.S., Vlad Kovac, Principal Floradale P.S., Geoff Suderman-Gladwell, Principal Linwood P.S., Wayne Dunham, Principal Three Bridges P.S., Susan Martin, Community Representative, John Krupicz, Parent Representative St. Jacobs P.S., Christine Shantz, Parent Representative Floradale P.S., Andrew Horst, Alternate Parent Representative Three Bridges, Steve Snyder, Parent Representative Three Bridges P.S., Krista Edwards, Parent Representative Linwood P.S., Cindy Weber, Parent Representative Linwood P.S., Keith Trask, Parent Representative St. Jacobs P.S., Dennis Cuomo, Manager of Planning, Andrea Kean, Recording Secretary and Nathan Hercanuck, Senior Planner for the Waterloo Region District School Board.

Regrets:

Susan Marchiori, Vice Principal Linwood P.S., Elmer Horst, Parent Representative Three Bridges P.S., Brenda Martin, Parent Representative Floradale P.S., John Scarfone, Manager of Planning, Township of Woolwich, Sarah Peck, Planner, Township of Wellesley, Ron Dallan, Manager of Capital Projects, Diane DeCoene, Superintendent of Education, Nick Landry, Manager of Enrolment, and Lauren Manske, Senior Planner for the Waterloo Region District School Board.

1. Welcome:

Mr. Hercanuck, Senior Planner for the Waterloo Region District School Board opened the meeting at 6:35 pm and welcomed members of the ARC.

2. ARC Meeting #14 – Draft Minutes Approval

Mr. Hercanuck asked the ARC if there were any errors or omissions in the draft minutes from ARC Meeting #14 (September 20, 2012).

- C: Steve Snyder asked for clarification on the location of the hydro poles at Three Bridges PS, noting that the hydro poles are located on the west side and therefore the cost of the bus lay-by should not include a relocation of that service.
- R: Mr. Hercanuck responded that the estimate for the bus lay-by may have been based on an old site plan and noted that he would stop by Three Bridges PS to clarify the location and adjust the estimate for the bus lay-by accordingly.

The minutes from ARC Meeting #14 approved without changes.

Moved by: Vlad Kovac Seconded by: Wayne Dunham Mr. Hercanuck advised that hardcopies of the minutes will be sent out to the schools for the school binder and posted on the Board website at:

http://www.wrdsb.ca/planning/accommodation-reviews/woolwich-and-wellesley-townships-elementary-schools

Mr. Hercanuck led the ARC through tonight's presentation, available online at: http://www.wrdsb.ca/planning/files/2012/04/03.oct12.arcmtg.presentation-.pdf

3. Scenario Review/Revisions

• Status Ouo

Three Bridges PS remains open with no change from current situation.

• Scenario 3

Referring to slide 14 of the online presentation, Mr. Hercanuck advised that the boundary has been modified between St. Jacobs PS and Floradale PS to trade parts of projection areas I and J. The boundary now runs along Hawkesville Road, Kressler and the river, north of Ament Line. This boundary modification did not change the enrolment projections much from the original Scenario 3 as it was an even number of students trading spots between the projection areas of I and J.

Scenario 3 Details:

- Three Bridges PS is closed with its students directed to St. Jacobs PS and Floradale PS.
- St. Jacobs PS gets projection areas G, H, K, L and portions of I and J.
- Floradale PS gets portions of projection areas I and J from St. Jacobs PS.

• Scenario 10 (with revisions – A and B)

Scenario 10 (slide 3 of the online presentation) which was presented at the last meeting, is similar to Scenario 3 but moves projection area A from Floradale PS to Linwood PS as some of the area is closer geographically to Linwood PS. This change results in a significantly reduced enrolment at Floradale PS.

Scenario 10 Details:

- Three Bridges PS is closed with its students directed to St. Jacobs PS and Floradale PS.
- St. Jacobs PS gets projection areas G, H, K, L and portions of I and J.
- Floradale PS gets portions of projection areas I and J from St. Jacobs PS.
- · Linwood gets projection area A from Floradale PS.

The working group discussed dividing up projection area A so that those closer to Linwood PS could attend there while not having as great an impact on the enrolment at Floradale PS. The following 2 new Scenarios attempt to modify Scenario 10 in that regard:

• Scenario 10(A) (slide 4 of the online presentation)

Mr. Hercanuck noted that the division point for projection area A is the Conestoga River and Line 86. Everyone west of the river and south of Line 86 will go to Linwood PS; those east of the river (all of Wallenstein, and everyone in the area on Line 86) will stay at Floradale PS.

Scenario 10 (A) Details:

- Three Bridges PS is closed with its students directed to St. Jacobs PS and Floradale PS.
- St. Jacobs PS gets projection areas G, H, K, and portions of I and J.
- Floradale PS gets portions of projection areas I and J from St. Jacobs PS. (31 students)
- Linwood PS gets the portion of projection area A west of Conestoga River from Floradale PS. (24 students)

- Scenario 10(B) (slide 5 of the online presentation)
 - This scenario attempts to adjust Scenario 10 by nudging up the boundary between Floradale PS and St. Jacobs PS to better match boundaries to distance to school. Previously the boundary followed Hawkesville Road; Scenario 10 (B) moves the boundary up to follow Hemlock Hill Drive to King Street then follows the railway tracks out of St. Jacobs to Scotch Line then down to New Jerusalem Road. The effect of this scenario (B) over (A) will move approximately 20 students from Floradale PS to St. Jacobs PS. Scenario 10 (B) Details:
 - Three Bridges PS is closed with its students directed to St. Jacobs PS and Floradale PS.
 - St. Jacobs PS gets projection areas G, H, K, L and most of I and J.
 - Floradale PS gets portions of projection areas I and J from St. Jacobs PS.
 - · Linwood PS gets projection area A west of Conestoga River from Floradale PS.

ARC Discussion on new Scenarios 10(A) and 10(B):

The ARC discussed possible implications the new scenarios may have on enrolments, bussing times/distance to school, portable needs and school staffing while keeping in mind that some members of the Three Bridges PS community had expressed their preference to have their children attend the more rural Floradale PS rather than the more urban St. Jacobs PS and would likely not mind the longer bus rides.

ARC members Christine Shantz and Susan Martin expressed their preference for Scenario 10(A) for its attempt at *the reasonable accommodation of cultural differences* which responds to the expressed preference of some members of the Three Bridges PS community.

It was suggested that students should not be over transported and Floradale PS should not be underutilized.

When asked about FDK funding for St. Jacobs PS, Mr. Hercanuck advised that the Board is still waiting to hear back from the Ministry of Education for the funding amount for the Fullday Kindergarten (FDK) program for St. Jacobs PS which is scheduled to begin in September 2014; funding announcements for schools undergoing an accommodation review may sometimes be deferred by the Ministry until the outcome of a review has been decided.

- Q: Keith Trask asked if the ARC needs to recommend attendance boundaries in the scenarios.
- R: Mr. Hercanuck responded that the ARC does need to recommend boundaries because boundaries are a driving force for the scenarios and objectives; attendance boundaries control the enrolment numbers which regulates staffing and can support the need for any capital requests.

The ARC discussed the possibility of a separate boundary study to look at adjusting boundaries to direct students from Conestoga PS to Floradale PS.

Mr. Hercanuck noted that Conestogo PS is a small school organization and any shift in boundary could create fewer classes, resulting in a similar problem at that school that exists at Floradale PS. He advised that a boundary study could not be considered for Conestogo PS until after a decision has been made in this current accommodation review.

- Q: Steve Snyder asked if the Board would consider building one new school to accommodate both St. Jacobs and Conestogo school community.
- R: John Krupicz responded that would require a new school site and would result in a total bussed in population.
- R: Mr. Hercanuck responded that earlier on in the process the ARC had discussed the possibility of bringing Conestogo PS into the review but had decided against it; he advised that to do so at this point would require that the accommodation review start over from the beginning.

4. Scenario Staffing Requirements

Referring to slides 6 - 10 and 13 of the online presentation, Mr. Hercanuck outline the projected staffing requirements for scenarios Status Quo, 3, 10, 10(A) and 10(B) noting that the staffing numbers are estimates based on 2016 projected enrolments and do not include Secretarial or Library Staffing; all staffing allocations are based on projected enrolments.

It was noted that the custodial staff does not add up to the number of staff currently at some of the review area schools and Mr. Hercanuck advised that he will enquire into allotments.

- Q: Keith Trask asked if the savings in staffing could be translated into financial savings over the 10 year period.
- R: Mr. Hercanuck responded that staffing costs are not included in scenarios in financial terms because it is very difficult to put a dollar amount on due to varying pay grades for staff. Savings in staffing is listed in terms of number of positions only and that the Board has not previously made staffing savings an element of project business cases. He noted that all scenarios other than Status Quo improve efficiencies.
- C: Mr. Cuomo commented that any savings achieved on staffing cannot be used for capital requirements. The Board gets its funding from the Ministry of Education based on its enrolment.
- C: Geoff Suderman-Gladwell noted that 85 percent of the Board's budget is for staff salaries; the Board can overspend for staffing and borrow from operating and renewal monies to cover but the Board cannot take money from the classroom to pay for operating and renewal requirements. He noted that any staff displaced from Three Bridges PS would likely be absorbed elsewhere in our growing Board.

Scenario Capital (and Operating) Requirements

Referring to slides 11 - 12 and 13 of the online presentation, Mr. Hercanuck went over the Scenario Capital (and Operating) Requirements for scenarios: Status Quo, 3, 10, 10(A) and 10(B), noting that no additional classroom space would be required to implement the new scenarios with the only cost being the ongoing maintenance of the retained facilities.

Mr. Hercanuck also advised that the Other Required Capital under Status Quo would be revised to an estimated \$50,000 if hydro services do not have to be moved to allow for the bus lay-by required for Three Bridges PS.

- Q: Keith Trask questioned grouping the size requirements together noting that extra funding may be required for additional classrooms at St. Jacobs PS under Scenario 10B.
- R: Mr. Hercanuck responded that the Board would generally not build a 2 classroom addition but would use portable classrooms to accommodate, noting the FDK additions being exceptions as they are being built to allow for suitable classrooms to house that program with its special requirements.

Action Items:

- Mr. Hercanuck to visit Three Bridges PS to view location of Hydro Servicing.
- Mr. Hercanuck to get clarification on custodial staffing allocations.

Scenario Objectives Review

Referring to slides 15-21 of the online presentation, Mr. Hercanuck went over how each of the Scenarios meets or does not meet the review objectives as follows:

Scenario 3 Objectives Review

Objective	Objective Met?	Comments
Ensure equitable student access to a community school by having defined attendance area boundaries that relate geographically to the community it is located in.	X	Defined boundaries however, do not relate geographically to communities. Portions of Floradale PS boundary closer to Linwood and St. Jacobs communities.
Where possible organize school attendance boundaries to minimize distance to school (time on bus)	×	Portion of Floradale boundary closer to Linwood PS and St. Jacobs PS.
Address student transitions where changes proposed.	TBD	Transitions not yet confirmed.
Have regard for Board policy 3002; Elementary School Size and Configuration, recognizing the challenges of rural areas.	V	Larger enrolment at Floradale PS creating more equitable distribution of enrolment between Floradale/St. Jacobs
Support the efficient use of capital and operating resources through the consideration of facility condition, accessibility, and equitable access to educational amenities.	\	 Three Bridges PS closed, removing the maintenance/operations costs at that facility. St. Jacobs PS requires significant funds in future. Less facilities, less staff costs.
Maximize the number of students accommodated in permanent capacity		All students housed in permanent capacity. (1 portable possible at St. Jacobs PS in the long term)
Maximize the use of existing capacity within facilities		Three Bridges closed (existing capacity) Retained facilities fully utilized.
Recognize the unique needs of communities served by different schools through the reasonable accommodation of cultural differences.	\	 Directed Three Bridges community to St. Jacobs/Floradale Some of Three Bridges population may be more comfortable attending Floradale than St. Jacobs Sends largest proportion of Three Bridges families to Floradale.

Scenario 10 Objectives Review:

Objective	Objective Met?	Comments
Ensure equitable student access to a community school by having defined attendance area boundaries that relate geographically to the community it is located in.	X	Defined boundaries however a number of areas closer to a school other than home school.
Where possible organize school attendance boundaries to minimize distance to school (time on bus)	X	Areas of Floradale boundary closer to St. Jacobs,. Areas of Linwood Boundary closer to Floradale.
Address student transitions where changes proposed.	TBD	Transitions not yet confirmed.
Have regard for Board policy 3002; Elementary School Size and Configuration, recognizing the challenges of rural areas.	×	Less even distribution of enrolment between facilities.
Support the efficient use of capital and operating resources through the consideration of facility condition, accessibility, and equitable access to educational amenities.	\	 Three Bridges PS closed, removing the maintenance/operations costs at that facility. St. Jacobs PS requires significant funds in future. Less facilities, less staff costs.
Maximize the number of students accommodated in permanent capacity	$\overline{\checkmark}$	All students housed in permanent capacity. (! Portable may become necessary at St. Jacobs)
Maximize the use of existing capacity within facilities	\checkmark	Three Bridges closed (existing capacity). Retained facilities fully utilized.
Recognize the unique needs of communities served by different schools through the reasonable accommodation of cultural differences.	\	 Directed Three Bridges community to St. Jacobs/Floradale. Some of Three Bridges population may be more comfortable attending Floradale than St. Jacobs Sends largest proportion of Three Bridges families to Floradale.

Scenario 10(A) Objectives Review:

Objective	Objective Met?	Comments
Ensure equitable student access to a community school by having defined attendance area boundaries that relate geographically to the community it is located in.	×	Defined boundaries however a number of areas closer to a school other than home school.
Where possible organize school attendance boundaries to minimize distance to school (time on bus)	×	Areas of Floradale boundary closer to St. Jacobs.
Address student transitions where changes proposed.	TBD	Transitions not yet confirmed.
Have regard for Board policy 3002; Elementary School Size and Configuration, recognizing the challenges of rural areas.	V	Floradale PS maintains current enrolment.
Support the efficient use of capital and operating resources through the consideration of facility condition, accessibility, and equitable access to educational amenities.	<u> </u>	 Three Bridges PS closed, removing the maintenance/operations costs at that facility. St. Jacobs PS requires significant funds in future. Less facilities, less staff costs.
Maximize the number of students accommodated in permanent capacity		All students housed in permanent capacity. (! Portable may become necessary at St. Jacobs)
Maximize the use of existing capacity within facilities	$\overline{\checkmark}$	Three Bridges closed (existing capacity).Retained facilities fully utilized.
Recognize the unique needs of communities served by different schools through the reasonable accommodation of cultural differences.	V	 Directed Three Bridges community to St. Jacobs/Floradale. Some of Three Bridges population may be more comfortable attending Floradale than St. Jacobs Sends largest proportion of Three Bridges families to Floradale.

Scenario 10(B) Objectives Review:

Objective	Objective Met?	Comments
Ensure equitable student access to a community school by having defined attendance area boundaries that relate geographically to the community it is located in.	V	Defined boundaries better relate geographically to communities.
Where possible organize school attendance boundaries to minimize distance to school (time on bus)	V	Improves current distance to school boundary organization.
Address student transitions where changes proposed.	TBD	Transitions not yet confirmed.
Have regard for Board policy 3002; Elementary School Size and Configuration, recognizing the challenges of rural areas.	×	Further skews the enrolment distribution.
Support the efficient use of capital and operating resources through the consideration of facility condition, accessibility, and equitable access to educational amenities.	\lambda	 Three Bridges PS closed, removing the maintenance/operations costs at that facility. St. Jacobs PS requires significant funds in future. Less facilities, less staff costs.
Maximize the number of students accommodated in permanent capacity	×	St. Jacobs PS, may likely require 2 or more portables in long term.
Maximize the use of existing capacity within facilities	$\overline{\mathbf{A}}$	Three Bridges closed (existing capacity).Retained facilities fully utilized.
Recognize the unique needs of communities served by different schools through the reasonable accommodation of cultural differences.	X	 Directed Three Bridges community to St. Jacobs. Some of Three Bridges population may be more comfortable attending Floradale than St. Jacobs Sends smallest proportion of Three Bridges families to Floradale.

The ARC discussed the possibility of weighting the review objectives at length, questioning which objectives would be the most important to be met by the scenarios and determined that the importance of the objective may weighted differently depending on what their personal opinion.

Mr. Hercanuck advised that he is open to weighing the objectives but noted that in past reviews the objective review has been used to determine that an objective has been considered and noted that he has never seen a scenario in any review that has met all of the objectives; and ARCs do not always chose the scenario with the most met objectives. The ARC report will address the rationale for scenario selection and explain why a particular scenario was chosen.

The ARC agreed to not weight the objectives unless they struggle with a scenario recommendation later based on which objectives are most important to be met.

- Q: John Krupicz noted that the ongoing and needed maintenance costs for St. Jacobs PS amount to approximately 75 percent of the cost of a new school and including areas where St. Jacobs PS does not provide an equal opportunity of program/facility to its students and asked at what point the ARC could make a recommendation for a rebuild of St. Jacobs PS.
- R: Mr. Hercanuck responded that the review should be used to highlight any issues in the review area but noted that these extra capital requests are always developed after the ARC has reached a consensus on which scenario(s) to recommend to the Board, which will be after Public Meeting #3. The ARC can then add any additional pieces it determines are needed.

R: Mr. Cuomo commented that the ARC will make its recommendations and Board administration will also prepare an analysis of the report; noting that in his past experience with ARCs not all recommendations will get approval from the Trustees.

5. Future Meeting Dates/Times

Mr. Hercanuck advised the ARC that Public Meeting #3 has been scheduled for Thursday, October 18th at Elmira District Secondary School and asked the ARC to decide which of the Scenarios 3, 10, 10(A) or 10(B) the ARC felt best meets the objectives and should be brought forward to the community has the preferred Scenario if the Board decides not to continue with Status Quo.

After lengthy consideration the ARC members agreed to bring Scenario 10(A) to the public meeting along with Status Quo Scenario.

Public Meeting #3 – Thursday, October 18, 2012 at Elmira District Secondary School.

ARC Meeting #16 - Tuesday, October 23, 2012, 6:30-8:00 p.m. at Three Bridges P.S.

Mr. Hercanuck thanked the ARC members for attending and adjourned the meeting at 8:45 p.m.

FUTURE MEETING DATES:

PUBLIC MEETINGS:

Public Meeting #3 - October 18, 2012 from 7:30-9:00 p.m. at Elmira District Secondary School **Public Meeting #4** - TDB

ARC MEETINGS:

ARC Meeting #16: October 23, 2012 from 6:30-8:00 p.m. at Three Bridges P.S. Library