



**Breslau/Stanley Park Elementary Schools Pupil Accommodation  
Review  
Minutes of Accommodation Review Committee Meeting # 13  
November 17th, 2010 – 6:00 pm**

The thirteenth meeting of the Breslau/Stanley Park Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) was held at Stanley Park P.S. on November 17th, 2010.

Committee Members Present:

Pauline Shiry, Principal of Mackenzie King P.S., Carolyn Griffiths, Principal of Crestview P.S., Jodi Albrecht, Vice Principal of Stanley Park P.S., Libby Martz, Vice Principal of Lackner Woods P.S., Ron Dallan, Facility Services, Crysta Fernandez, parent – Stanley Park P.S., Doug Hudson, parent – Breslau P.S., Tracy Jasmins, parent – Mackenzie King P.S., Mark Richardson, parent – Stanley Park P.S., Lesley Kraehling, parent – Crestview P.S., Sean Mahoney, parent – Mackenzie King P.S., Troy Starr, parent – Smithson P.S., Laurie Tremble, parent – Lackner Woods P.S., Tania Hunter, parent – Crestview P.S., Anessa Selcage, parent – Franklin P.S., Aimie LeRuez, parent – Smithson P.S., Kathy Waybrant, Community Representative, Mary Hingley, recording secretary, Nathan Hercanuck, Senior Planner, Lauren Manske, Senior Planner and Chris Smith, Manager of Planning for the Waterloo Region District School Board.

Regrets:

Gregg Bereznick, Area Superintendent, Rob MacQueen, Principal of Stanley Park P.S., William Grobe, Principal of Breslau P.S., Carolyn Graham, Principal of Smithson P.S., Darv Easton, Acting Principal – Breslau P.S., John Scarfone, Township of Woolwich, Brian Bateman, City of Kitchener, Jane Pritchard, Principal of Franklin P.S., Nancy Allan Catton, parent – Breslau P.S., Janice Scherer, parent – Franklin P.S., T. Ritchie, parent – Lackner Woods P.S.,

**1. Welcome**

Chris Smith, Manager of Planning welcomed members of the ARC and opened the meeting at 6:05 p.m.

**2. ARC Meeting # 12 – Draft Minutes Approval**

- Mr. Smith asked the group if there were any corrections/concerns with the minutes from the November 3rd ARC meeting.
  - No concerns or corrections were raised.
  - Minutes from the November 3rd meeting were approved.
  - Mover: Doug Hudson
  - Seconded: Tracy Jasmins
- Mr. Smith advised that minutes from the Joint ARC # 11 Meeting held on October 12, 2010 have been approved:
  - Mover: Tania Hunter (Breslau/Stanley Park ARC)
  - Seconded: Jennifer Childs (Grand River South/Sunnyside ARC)

- ARC # 11 minutes will be posted to the Board's website under each Accommodation Review:

For Breslau/Stanley Park:

<http://www.wrdsb.ca/planning/accommodation-reviews/breslau-stanley-park-elementary-schools-accommodation-review>

Tonight's ARC presentation can be viewed on the link above as well.

For Grand River South/Sunnyside:

<http://www.wrdsb.ca/about-us/planning/accommodation-reviews/grand-river-south/sunnyside-elementary-schools-accommodation>

### 3. Scenario Costing

Mr. Smith welcomed Ron Dallan, Manager of Capital Projects and Dale Wideman, Project Manager who will speak to the group about how they arrived at the estimated costs for each of the scenarios.

Mr. Dallan advised that the Ministry of Education's cost per square foot benchmark is the basis for these estimates. The Ministry has changed the way they scrutinize new school construction and additions. We submit a space template now with what we need, and the Ministry gives final approval for that funding.

- Mr. Dallan described the Ministry's pupil place funding formula.
- Additions are based on \$200 – 220/sq foot. Architect fees are approximately 7.5% of the construction value, and building permits, disbursements, etc., are additional costs.
- New school construction is based on \$150 – 160 /sq foot. Architect fees are approximately 4.5% of construction value and building permits, disbursements, etc., are additional costs. The lower cost for new school construction reflects the economies of scale and the fact that a new school starts as a "clean slate".

Mr. Dallan noted that the schools in the review area were all looked at in the beginning of this process and a Facility Condition Index (FCI) Report was done. The report detailed what was needed at each school.

Mr. Dallan provided the ARC with an update regarding the roof repair at Stanley Park P.S.

- A permanent solution is being put in place for the roof. A structural specialist firm (MTE) has been retained and have recommended a less costly longer term solution. A contractor has been hired and they will begin shoring up the classrooms in question. The work will begin shortly and will be done after school hours, so there will be no impact to the school day. There is no need to replace the entire roof structure with this solution.
- Cost of the work: \$65,000.

Q – Have they checked the whole school to ensure safety?

R – Yes, the firm has reviewed the entire school and will shore up any and all classrooms that need it.

**Scenario 1:**

<b>Facility</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Estimated Cost</b>
Breslau P.S.	receives 118 pupil place addition (5,800 square feet – 4 regular and 1 FDK classrooms) office, library, FDK, accessibility and parking	<b>\$ 2.45M</b>
Mackenzie King P.S.	receives 193 pupil place addition (10,000 square feet – 5 regular and 3 FDK classrooms) including office, accessibility, FDK and parking	<b>\$ 3.37M</b>
Smithson P.S.	receives parking lot improvements	<b>\$ 0.12M</b>
Stanley Park P.S.	roof repair/remediation.	<b>Completed</b>
	<b>Total</b>	<b>\$5.94M</b>

**Scenario 2:**

<b>Facility</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Estimated Cost</b>
Breslau P.S.	receives 118 pupil place addition (5,800 square feet – 4 regular and 1 FDK classrooms) office, library, FDK, accessibility and parking	<b>\$ 2.45M</b>
Mackenzie King P.S.	new 500 pupil place JK-8 school	<b>\$ 9.24M</b>
Smithson P.S.	receives parking lot improvements	<b>\$ 0.12M</b>
Crestview P.S.	receives 167 pupil place addition (9,500 square feet – 5 regular and 2 FDK classrooms) library and office upgrades and senior grade 7/8 facilities	<b>\$ 3.45M</b>
Stanley Park P.S.	demolition costs	<b>\$ 0.05M</b>
	<b>Total</b>	<b>\$15.31M</b>

Q – Concern about where the new Mackenzie King P.S. would be located, has any consideration been given to the site? The hill on the property is popular with the community.

R – We could consult with the principal to get some feedback. There may be limited space to build on the site if we kept the current operation running.

Mr. Smith noted that if this scenario goes further we may need to discuss a contingency plan to determine the best location for the new school; it may end up being where the current one sits. This could mean portables for a year or so for those students, or moving to a “host” school such as Smithson P.S.

Q – How long does it take to build a new school of that size?

R – Approximately 12 to 14 months, however you would need to add some extra time for demolition and clean up of the site if we build where the current school sits.

Q – Could a porta-pack be placed on the property to house students during construction?

R – You could, but then you have no gym/library access. Mr. Wideman added that temporary utilities, i.e. water, electrical for a porta-pack is very expensive and could impede the new school construction.

Mr. Smith added that a more likely solution in that case could be temporary portables on the Smithson P.S. site, as noted earlier.

Q – Could we rent out a closed school? For example the Catholic school (Notre Dame) that just closed in the neighbourhood.

R – That could be an option if the property hasn't been sold.

Q – Would all the projects proposed in this scenario be done at once?

R – Likely the work at Crestview P.S. and Mackenzie King P.S. would start first.

Q – Demolition of Stanley Park P.S., is that a given or would the property be sold as is?

R – Any closure would be phased out over 2 years, to avoid multiple transitions for students. The Board could sell the property as is, however vacant residential land is most marketable for this Board.

Mr. Wideman added that an empty school facility is a liability.

Mr. Hercanuck noted that the difference in cost estimates between the scenarios is significant; however we need to take into account cost recovery with the Stanley Park P.S. property and other capital expenditure deferrals (i.e. at Mackenzie King P.S.). The difference becomes less (probably closer to \$5M versus the \$10M we see in the presentation).

Q – Will you explain that at the Public Meeting to people?

R – Yes we will make that point; however we can't put an actual price in, it's more of a differential of \$5M.

Q – If Stanley Park P.S. closes, what happens to the staff?

R – We still have the same number of students, so there is no loss of teaching staff. New schools open with a staffing formula that takes into account staff displaced by a closure. There would be a need for one less administrator, but historically those positions are covered by retirements or leaves. Mr. Smith added that we could have area superintendent Gregg Bereznick expand on this answer for the ARC.

Q – Should we have added a financial implication piece to our objectives? Where does the money show for the public?

R – The costing is available now for the public to review. Cost is important, however not the driving factor in this process, we want the emphasis on good programs and good facilities first. Mr. Smith added that the \$5M differential over this number of facilities for the next 40 years or so is not really a huge hurdle when lower operating costs are factored in. It was also noted that the Trustees have not always gone with the lowest priced option in past accommodation reviews.

Q – The scenarios do about the same job when put up against the objectives. We know the Board is moving towards a JK-8 model, why does Sunnyside P.S. get to stay open and Stanley Park P.S. closes under Scenario 2? Why not just go with the cheaper option?

R – We now need broader public feedback to answer that. The ARC doesn't have to pick only 1 option in the recommendation. As mentioned at the joint ARC meeting, it's not feasible to move to a JK-8 model all at once, so some 7/8 schools will need to remain (the East K/W ARC recommended a review of the core senior 7/8 schools in the near future).

Q – Since the roof repair cost at Stanley Park P.S. is not as big a factor as we first believed, it magnifies the cost difference and changes the dynamic for me.

R – Yes, the repair is off the table now, what we really need to look at is what serves the students best.

C – May need to add that just fixing things at Mackenzie King P.S. (Scenario 1) may not be the long-term answer we are looking for.

R – The ARC's Recommendation and Report needs to stay neutral – can't overstate views.

Mr. Hercanuck noted that Planning will add a cost recovery amount to Scenario 2 before the scenarios are posted to the website on November 19, 2010 and presented at the public meeting on November 24<sup>th</sup>.

#### **4. Scenario Evaluation Review**

Mr. Hercanuck circulated a handout to the ARC that listed the Review Objectives and detailed the meets/doesn't meet chart for Scenario 1 and 2 completed at the last ARC meeting.

- The charts can be found in tonight's presentation as well.
- Mr. Hercanuck reviewed the chart for both scenarios with the ARC to ensure the comments represented fairly the ARC's feelings/decisions.
- Mr. Hercanuck also presented the ARC with a chart representing the potential transportation implications and number of transitions for both scenarios (a request from the last ARC meeting).
- Regarding the transportation implication charts: the numbers per area are based on today's figures and who would receive bussing – is difficult to predict that for the future.

##### **Scenario 1**

- Area E moves from Breslau P.S. to Mackenzie King P.S. for JK-6 and to Stanley Park for grades 7 and 8
- Area C moves from Mackenzie King P.S. to Smithson P.S. for JK-6
- Areas P and T move from Stanley Park P.S. to Sunnyside P.S. for the senior 7/8 program, eliminating the split feed from Lackner Woods and Franklin schools

##### **Scenario 2**

- Area E moves from Breslau P.S. to Mackenzie King P.S. (which becomes a JK-8)
- Area C moves from Mackenzie King P.S. to Smithson P.S. (JK-6)
- Smithson P.S. (JK-6) Areas B, C and G feed to Mackenzie King P.S. for grades 7/8
- Stanley Park P.S. closes
- Crestview becomes JK-8, receives senior French Immersion and Special Education from Stanley Park P.S. and Franklin P.S.
- Areas P and T move from Stanley Park P.S. to Sunnyside P.S. for grades 7/8

Under objective: *Maximize students within walking distance*. The ARC agreed to check both the meets/doesn't meets column, with the comment: *slight improvement*.

Under Objective: *Minimize number of student transitions*. Add to the comments: *with grandparent option for 7/8's, and keeps neighbourhoods together*.

- Changes were made to the review objectives by consensus of the ARC.

## 5. Public Meeting Format - Discussion

Mr. Smith noted that questions had been raised regarding the open house format for Public Meeting # 3 scheduled for November 24, 2010. He added that in past accommodation reviews this type of format was very well received. Found that people need time to look at each proposed scenario and ask specific questions. People don't always want to stand up in front of a big crowd to ask their questions – this format is a bit more personal.

- If the ARC feels a formal presentation is required for Public Meeting # 4, we can discuss that.

Mr. Smith added that attendance is taken at the meeting and comment sheets are handed out – tables and chairs will be provided for the public to write out their comments/concerns/questions before they leave.

Q – How is the feedback recorded?

R – Comment sheets, boundary feedback email address, Planning's contact number, comments to Planning staff.

C – Scenario 1 and 2 are different, we will get people's preference, i.e. how they feel personally about closing Stanley Park P.S. or transportation views, they won't have the history around each piece that we've had on the committee. Break out sessions might have provided that history.

R – People will comment from where they are today, most don't/can't look ahead, because it may not affect them. We can only get opinions from those that choose to come out (for instance; no one speaks for those families that haven't moved in yet). The ARC still needs to make the decision in the end, after listening to the feedback. Break out sessions can be a part of Public Meeting # 4 if the ARC feels it necessary. Ms. Manske added that both Scenario 1 and 2 have been presented to the public before in break out sessions – at Public Meeting # 2 on May 25, 2010.

C – Stanley Park P.S. will have a good turn out this time around because of the proposed closure.

R – If it is felt that a subsequent meeting at the school is needed to talk about closure and transitions, Planning will help facilitate that.

C – Transitions are looked at differently as well. Going from grade 6 to 7 is a transition, but so is moving schools because of a boundary change.

R – We try to cover those concerns as well.

## 6. Roundtable

Mr. Smith thanked Mr. Dallan and Mr. Wideman for their work on the estimates, and advised that we wanted to have the costing information available for Public Meeting # 3 on November 24, 2010. The feedback received at this meeting may lead the ARC to a recommended scenario.

Mr. Smith reiterated that the ARC members are not obligated to attend the Public Meeting, however may find it helpful to gauge the feedback in person.

- Feedback from the Public Meeting will be compiled and sent to the ARC soon after the meeting.

## **7. Future Meeting Dates**

- Public Meeting # 3 – Open House – will be held on Wednesday, November 24, 2010 from 5:30 – 7:30 pm at Mackenzie King P.S.
  - There will be no ARC meetings during the month of December, realizing that family commitments are a high priority during the month.
  - Mr. Hercanuck proposed Wednesday, January 12, 2011 at Stanley Park P.S. from 6:00 – 7:30 p.m. for ARC # 14.
    - The ARC agreed to the meeting date/time and location.
  - Mr. Smith thanked all for coming and the meeting adjourned at 8:00 p.m.
- 

### **Future Meeting Dates:**

**Public Meeting # 3 – Open House – Wednesday, November 24, 2010 from 5:30 – 7:30 pm  
at Mackenzie King P.S.**

**Wednesday, January 12, 2011 – 6:00 – 7:30 pm at Stanley Park P.S. – Library**